

**“Source: *Medically Assisted Procreation,*
Working Paper 65, 1992.
Department of Justice Canada.
Reproduced with the permission of the Minister of Public
Works and Government Services Canada, 2007.”**

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | xi |
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| CHAPTER ONE: Medical Aspects of Medically Assisted Procreation | 5 |
| I. Achieving Pregnancy | 5 |
| II. Infertility | 7 |
| A. Evaluation of the Infertile Couple | 7 |
| B. Causes of and Treatments for Infertility | 8 |
| III. Genetic Indications for Medically Assisted Procreation | 10 |
| IV. Medically Assisted Procreation Technologies | 11 |
| A. In Vitro Fertilization (IVF) | 11 |
| 1. Superovulation | 11 |
| 2. Egg Retrieval | 12 |
| 3. Evaluation of Eggs, Fertilization and Embryo Transfer | 13 |
| 4. IVF Success Rates | 13 |
| 5. Numerator Determination | 14 |
| 6. Denominator Determination | 14 |
| 7. International Results | 15 |
| 8. Canadian Results | 16 |
| 9. Other Outcomes of IVF | 17 |
| (a) <i>Multiple Pregnancies and Perinatal Risks</i> | 17 |
| (b) <i>Lowering the Multiple Pregnancy Rate</i> | 19 |
| (c) <i>Birth Defects</i> | 22 |
| (d) <i>Psychological Impact</i> | 23 |
| B. Gamete Intrafallopian Transfer (GIFT) | 24 |
| 1. Success Rates | 24 |
| 2. Complications | 25 |
| C. Other Procedures | 25 |
| D. Artificial Insemination | 26 |
| 1. The AI Procedure | 26 |
| 2. Outcomes | 27 |
| 3. AI Risks | 28 |
| 4. Donors | 28 |

| | | |
|---|---|----|
| E. | Ovum and Embryo Donation | 29 |
| 1. | The Ovum Donation Procedure | 30 |
| 2. | Ovum Donors | 30 |
| F. | Surrogacy | 31 |
| V. | Screening Gamete and Embryo Donations | 32 |
| CHAPTER TWO: Issues in Canadian Law | | 37 |
| I. | Medically Assisted Procreation and Private Law | 37 |
| A. | Potential Parents | 37 |
| 1. | Consent | 37 |
| 2. | Control over Gametes and Embryos | 39 |
| 3. | Post-Mortem Use of Gametes and Embryos | 45 |
| B. | Donors | 46 |
| 1. | The Legality, Legitimacy and Nature of Gamete and Embryo Donation | 46 |
| 2. | Gamete and Embryo Donations: Free and Anonymous | 51 |
| 3. | Donor Consent | 54 |
| 4. | Donor Liability | 55 |
| C. | Children | 56 |
| 1. | Legal Parentage | 56 |
| 2. | Biological Parentage | 59 |
| 3. | Legal Status | 61 |
| D. | Medical Personnel | 62 |
| 1. | Liability of Physicians | 62 |
| 2. | Liability of Gamete and Embryo Banks | 63 |
| II. | Surrogate Motherhood | 65 |
| A. | Issues | 65 |
| 1. | Legality and Legitimacy | 65 |
| 2. | Commercial Aspects of Surrogacy | 67 |
| B. | Children | 69 |
| 1. | Legal Parentage | 69 |
| 2. | Custody | 73 |
| III. | The <i>Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> | 74 |
| A. | Section 7: The Right to Life, Liberty and Security of the Person | 75 |
| 1. | The Right to Procreate | 77 |
| 2. | The Deprivation of Liberty or Security of the Person and the Principles of Fundamental Justice | 82 |

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| B. | The Application of Section 7 to Certain Aspects of Medically Assisted Procreation | 84 |
| 1. | The Enforceability of Surrogacy Contracts | 84 |
| 2. | In Vitro Fertilization | 88 |
| 3. | Artificial Insemination (AI) | 90 |
| 4. | The Right to Be Informed of One's Biological Origins | 90 |
| C. | Section 15 Equality Rights | 92 |
| D. | Section 1 | 98 |
| CHAPTER THREE: The Role of the State | | 101 |
| I. | The Scope of Existing Controls | 101 |
| A. | Individual Control: The Private Ordering Approach and Individual Responsibility | 102 |
| B. | Professional Control | 105 |
| 1. | The Medical Profession | 105 |
| 2. | Local Ethics Committees | 107 |
| C. | Community Control | 109 |
| 1. | Permanent Provincial or National Ethics Committees | 109 |
| 2. | The Courts | 110 |
| D. | Legislative and Regulatory Control | 111 |
| 1. | Legislative Control | 111 |
| 2. | Regulation of Procedures | 112 |
| II. | The Role of the State and the Federal Government in the Reform Process | 113 |
| A. | The Role of the State | 113 |
| B. | The Role of the Federal Government | 115 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: Recommendations | | 121 |
| I. | General Principles | 123 |
| A. | Access | 124 |
| B. | Commercialization | 129 |
| 1. | Embryos | 130 |
| 2. | Gametes | 131 |
| C. | Surrogacy | 132 |

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| D. | Control over Gametes and Embryos | 139 |
| 1. | Embryos | 140 |
| 2. | Gametes | 143 |
| 3. | Post-Mortem Use of Gametes and Embryos | 145 |
| E. | Parentage | 146 |
| 1. | Donation of Gametes and Embryos | 146 |
| 2. | Surrogacy | 148 |
| II. | Medically Assisted Procreation and Safety | 149 |
| A. | Success Rates: The Importance of Informed Consent | 149 |
| B. | Risks | 151 |
| 1. | Physical Risks | 151 |
| 2. | Psychological Risks | 156 |
| C. | Record Keeping | 157 |
| D. | Long-term Evaluation | 160 |
| III. | Implementing the Recommendations | 161 |
| A. | Controlling Practice | 161 |
| B. | The Need for a National Agency | 163 |
| | SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS | 167 |
| | APPENDIX A: Comparative Study of Foreign and Canadian Texts Dealing with Medically Assisted Procreation | 173 |
| | Introduction | 173 |
| I. | General Principles | 177 |
| A. | Access | 177 |
| 1. | Personal Criteria | 177 |
| 2. | Medical Criteria | 178 |
| B. | Commercialization | 179 |
| C. | Surrogacy | 180 |
| D. | Control over Gametes and Embryos | 182 |
| 1. | The Exercise of Control | 182 |
| (a) | <i>Consent</i> | 182 |
| (b) | <i>Use of Gametes</i> | 184 |
| (c) | <i>Use of Embryos</i> | 185 |
| 2. | Post-Mortem Use of Gametes and Embryos | 186 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| E. Parentage | 187 |
| 1. Gamete and Embryo Donation | 187 |
| 2. Surrogacy | 189 |
| II. Safety of Medically Assisted Procreation Technologies | 190 |
| A. Practical Standards | 191 |
| 1. Physical Risks | 191 |
| 2. The Frequency of Use of Gametes from a Single Donor | 192 |
| 3. Counselling | 193 |
| B. Record Keeping and Access to Information | 193 |
| 1. Record Keeping and Centralization of Information | 193 |
| 2. Access to Information | 194 |
| C. Liability of Donors and Remedies Available to Children | 196 |
| III. Medical Control and Regulation | 196 |
| A. Medical Control | 197 |
| B. Regulation of Technologies | 198 |
| Table 1: Eligibility for Medically Assisted Procreation Services (Except Surrogacy) | 201 |
| Table 2: Conditions for Access to Medically Assisted Procreation Services (Except Surrogacy) | 203 |
| Table 3: Time Limits Applicable to the Storage and Commercial Use of Gametes and Embryos | 206 |
| Table 4: Surrogacy | 210 |
| List of Texts Cited | 214 |
| APPENDIX B: Proposed Contents of a Medically Assisted Procreation Act | 221 |
| TABLE OF CASES | 231 |
| TABLE OF CANADIAN STATUTES AND INTERNATIONAL TREATIES ... | 235 |
| SELECTIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY | 237 |
| LIST OF OUR REPORTS AND WORKING PAPERS | 243 |