

**Report of the Attorney General's
Advisory Committee
*on***

**Charge Screening, Disclosure,
and
Resolution Discussions**

The Honourable G. Arthur Martin, O.C., OOnt., Q.C., LL.D.
Chair



Ontario

**Advisory Committee to the Attorney General
on Screening of Criminal Charges,
Resolution Discussions and Disclosure**

The Honourable G. Arthur Martin, O.C., O. Ont., Q.C., LL.D.
Chair

Mr. B. Lee Baig, Q.C.
Committee Member

Mr. D. Fletcher Dawson
Committee Member

Mr. Joe DeFilippis
Committee Member

Chief Julian Fantino
Committee Member

Superintendent Wayne Frechette
Committee Member

Ms. Mary Hall
Committee Member

Mr. S. Casey Hill
Committee Member

Mr. Earl Levy, Q.C.
Committee Member

Inspector Rolly MacDonald
Committee Member

Ms. Katherine McLeod
Committee Member

Mr. Daniel M. Mitchell
Committee Member

Staff Sgt. Alfred W. Oakley
Committee Member

Mr. W. Brian Trafford, Q.C.
Committee Member

Ms. Beverly Ward
Committee Member

David Butt
Researcher

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
The Mandate and Proceedings of the Committee	1
CHAPTER I: AN OVERVIEW OF THE ISSUES BEFORE THE COMMITTEE ..	11
A. The Importance of the Early Stages of the Criminal Process	11
B. Criminal Procedure and the Early Stages of the Criminal Process	20
C. Principal Aspects of the Committee's Recommendations	25
1. The Role and Responsibility of Counsel and the Police	25
2. The Need for Sound Organization and Management	41
CHAPTER II: CHARGE SCREENING	51
A. The Threshold Test for Commencing or Continuing a Prosecution	51
1. The Threshold Standards or Tests Currently Applied	52
2. The <i>Prima Facie</i> Case Threshold Test	55
3. The Proposed Standard of the Law Reform Commission of Canada	59
4. The Committee's Formulation of the Threshold Test	60
5. The Threshold Test and the Public Interest	74

6.	Various Public Interest Factors that May be Relevant	77
	<i>The Gravity of the Incident</i>	78
	<i>Political Consequences</i>	80
	<i>The Victim</i>	82
	<i>The Availability of Compensation, Restitution, or Reparation</i>	87
	<i>The Status in Life of the Accused or Victim</i>	89
	<i>Public Confidence and Public Order</i>	92
	<i>National Security and International Relations</i>	95
	<i>Alternatives to Prosecution</i>	96
	<i>Other Factors</i>	99
7.	The Scope of the Threshold Test	104
8.	The Threshold Test and Policies, Directives, and Guidelines in General	104
B.	Should There Be Charge Screening in Ontario?	113
C.	Should Charge Screening Be Pre- or Post-Charge?	120
D.	The Mechanics of Post-Charge Screening	127
1.	The Timing of Post-Charge Screening	128
2.	Information Required by the Crown for Charge Screening	130
3.	The Flow of Information Between Crown Counsel and the Police	133

4.	Other Aspects of Post-Charge Screening	136
5.	The Personnel Implications of Post-Charge Screening	141
CHAPTER III: DISCLOSURE		143
A.	The Evolution of Disclosure in Ontario	144
B.	The <i>Stinchcombe</i> Case	145
C.	The Committee's Approach to Disclosure	149
D.	General Recommendations With Respect to Disclosure	150
1.	Disclosure Recommendations Pertaining to Investigations	150
2.	Ethical and Legal Obligations Relating to Disclosure	166
	<i>The Police</i>	167
	<i>Crown Counsel</i>	170
	<i>Defence Counsel</i>	175
3.	Disclosure and Summary Conviction Offences	184
4.	Other Recommendations	189
E.	Recommendations Relevant to a Proposed New Disclosure Directive	193
1.	Purpose and General Principles of Disclosure	195
	<i>Possession and Control</i>	197

	<i>The Meaning of "Relevant" for Disclosure Purposes</i>	199
	<i>Limitations on the Use of Information for Impeachment Purposes</i>	202
	<i>The Represented Accused</i>	217
	<i>The Unrepresented Accused</i>	218
2.	Particular Requirements	221
	<i>Criminal Records of Witnesses</i>	238
F.	Implementing Disclosure	262
1.	Police Disclosure to the Crown	264
2.	Paying for Disclosure	266
3.	Disclosure and Accused Persons in Custody	273
	CHAPTER IV: RESOLUTION DISCUSSIONS	275
A.	The Development of Resolution Discussions	275
B.	Recommendations Regarding Resolution Discussions	291
1.	Recommendations Relating to the Conduct of Resolution Discussions	291
2.	Recommendations Concerning Courtroom Practice Following Resolution Discussions	315
C.	Procedural Aspects of Resolution Discussions	334
D.	Pre-Hearing Conferences	348

CONCLUDING RECOMMENDATION	387
APPENDICES	
APPENDIX A: The Mandate of the Committee	391
APPENDIX B: Disclosure Policy Statement	395
APPENDIX C: Issues: Charge Screening, Disclosure, Resolution Discussions	397
APPENDIX D: Invitees for Consultation	405
APPENDIX E: Submissions Received	413
APPENDIX F: Invitees for Consultation - By Location	417
APPENDIX G: Persons Who Made Oral Submissions	431
APPENDIX H: Issues: Charge Screening, Disclosure, Resolution Discussions - Revised for the Judiciary	435
APPENDIX I: Study of the Cost of Disclosure	443
APPENDIX J: Summary of the Committee's Recommendations	461
APPENDIX K: Windsor Joint Forces Court Services: A Successful Approach to the Early Stages of the Criminal Process	481
APPENDIX L: Financial Analysis of the Committee's Recommendations	497